

## Over-tourism and the fall of Venice as a destination

Hugues Seraphin<sup>a,\*</sup>

[Hugues.seraphin@winchester.ac.uk](mailto:Hugues.seraphin@winchester.ac.uk)

Paul Sheeran<sup>b</sup>

[Paul.Sheeran@winchester.ac.uk](mailto:Paul.Sheeran@winchester.ac.uk)

Manuela Pilato<sup>c</sup>

[Manuela.Pilato@winchester.ac.uk](mailto:Manuela.Pilato@winchester.ac.uk)

<sup>a</sup>Event and Tourism Management [StudiesStudies](#), University of [WinchesterWinchester](#), UK

<sup>b</sup>International Business and [EconomicsEconomics](#), University of [WinchesterWinchester](#), UK

<sup>c</sup>Business Management, University of [WinchesterWinchester](#), UK

\*Corresponding author.

---

### Abstract

This *Regional Spotlight Paper* considers the issue of over-tourism and the (ecological) survival of Venice as a destination. Within Venice, ecology, economics and culture are inextricably linked to the conflict between human and natural capital. The attempts to neatly arrange the challenges in sustaining the city convenient categorical interest groups and occasional hostility in implementing policies call for an ambidextrous management approach (exploitation and exploration) instead of the *Trexit* approach suggested by the anti-tourism movements.

---

**Keywords:** Venice; [ambidextrousAmbidextrous](#) management; [over-tourismOver-tourism](#); [sustainabilitySustainability](#); [trexitTrexit](#)

## 1 Over-tourism

Many anti-tourism movements or ‘resistant identities’ (Routledge, 2001) are voicing their concern regarding the continuously growing number of tourists visiting Europe. Anti-tourism protesters have been particularly virulent in Spain and Italy and to a lesser extent in England and Croatia (Coldwell, 2017; Tapper, 2017). The reasons for this rise of anti-tourism are quite varied. Among the main reasons, a large number of visitors is putting the UNESCO World Heritage status of some destination at risk; tourists are impacting negatively on the quality of life of locals; the environmental sustainability of destinations are jeopardised; the positive contribution of tourists (day-trippers) to local legal businesses is limited (Buckley, 2017; Leadbeater, 2017; Paris, 2017). The rise of anti-tourism across Europe clearly shows that when tourism is not managed correctly it has the potential to cause much damage and disruption (Coldwell, 2017). This movement is also symptomatic of a change of paradigm. Locals are now more interested in their quality of life than the income generated by the tourism industry (Croes, Rivera, Semrad, & Khalizadeh, 2017). More importantly, this situation across Europe provides evidence that sustainability in tourism is something that has yet to be achieved with the industry not fully comprehending how it is in fact to be achieved. Because of the Janus-faced character of the tourism industry (Sanchez & Adams, 2008), a tailor made management strategy must be developed to cope with the current situation in each specific destination. In this *Regional Spotlight Paper*, an ‘ambidextrous management’ approach to the management of tourist destinations is advanced as a potential solution.

This management approach that has been hailed to be innovative, sustainable and at the basis of success (Mihalache & Mihalache, 2016; Smith, 2017), implies putting together two opposites: first, *exploitation* (focusing on existing customers and/or markets). The focus is on the present (exploiting and improving the existing products, services, competencies and operating strategies). Second, *exploration* (creative and innovative aspects), with a focus on the future (experimenting with new products, services, competencies and operating strategies). Mihalache and Mihalache (2016) also explain that tourism organisations, and in turn destinations, can only achieve long-term growth in an increasingly competitive market by being innovative. They argue that innovation can be enhanced by applying organisational ambidexterity, as this ‘enables firms to make the most of their current capabilities while at the same time

developing new ones to attract new customers' (Mihalache & Mihalache, 2016, p.144). Stokes, Moore, Smith, Larson, and Brindley (2016) add to this definition by arguing that organisations in advanced-market economies tend towards exploratory management and policies, while emerging market economies are associated with exploitation. As an example, by allowing local Haitians to enter the resort of Labadee (that has been defined as an 'enclave') and trade souvenirs on payment of a fee, Royal Caribbean International (RCI) has managed to improve its relationship with the locals in the destination (Louis-Joseph, 2016; Weeden, 2015). This example provides evidence that an ambidextrous management approach can be effective.

The Janus-faced character of the ambidextrous management approach seems to be compatible with the Janus-faced character of the tourism industry. Therefore, the research objective of this *Regional Spotlight Paper* is to show that a tailor-made ambidextrous management approach would be a suitable management strategy that could be applied to a falling destination like Venice, victim among other things of over-tourism. The term 'over-tourism' has been defined by Richardson (2017) as any destination suffering the strain of tourism. The term is also to be related to what is more generally known as the carrying capacity, that is to say the maximum limit to tourism development (Borg, Costa, & Gotti, 1996).

In this *Regional Spotlight Paper*, we are also going to show that in the case of Venice, a forced *Trexit* (term that we have created and which is a short for tourism exit) is not an economically sustainable solution. Also, in terms of image, a forced *Trexit* could be detrimental for these destinations. This is all the more important when considering how important the image of a destination is in terms of capacity to attract visitors and how difficult it is for a destination to revamp its image once it is damaged (S raphin, Butcher & Konstanje, 2016). Indeed, in practice *Trexit* would consist in forbidding the access to destinations during a certain period of time, following the model of the island of Niuhau (home to many rare and endangered regional species) where only visits from government officials or relatives of the 130 indigenous residents are allowed (Amey, 2015).

## 2 Venice - The destination context

Venice is a middle-sized heritage European city. It is also one of the most popular tourist destinations in the world. In 2017 the city received an average of 60, 000 visits per day (Modak, 2017). Strong tourism pressure is eroding the quality of the tourism attractions and offerings (Ganzaroli, (Ganzaroli, De Noni & Van Baalen, 2017 De Noni & Van Baalen, 2017)).

Since its foundation, the Venetian Republic considered Venice and its lagoon as a single entity. It was added to the UNESCO World Heritage list in 1987 (WCED, (WCED, 1987-1987)). It is not an exaggeration to suggest that 2017-18 2017-18 might see Venice being added to the UNESCO list of endangered sites. However, the contention with this measure is that the World Heritage Site (WHS) designation has over time evolved from a technical measure aimed exclusively at preservation into a brand that countries use to attract tourists, and that tourists, in turn, rely on in selecting the destinations they will visit (Ryan & Silvanto, 2009).

Notwithstanding, the adverse impacts of overtourism include locals' loss of sense of belonging and sense of place; increased congestion and privatisation of public spaces; the rise in tourism induced real estate speculation; decline in purchasing power parity of local residents versus visitors; dismantling of socio-cultural connectivity (Milano, 2017), detrimental use of urban, rural and coastal spaces (Colomb & Novy, 2016). The number of visitors is not the only reason why Venice is endangered. As in many destinations victim of overtourism, the commercially expedient practices of policymakers, destination managers and tourism firms are also major forces at play (Colomb & Novy, 2016).

The disastrous floods of mid-1960s brought the environmental vulnerabilities of Venice to the attention of the international community (Deheyna (Deheyna and Shaffer, 2007 and Shaffer, 2007)). In addition, Venice, is unsurprisingly highly vulnerable to climate change (The World Bank, IBRD-IDA, 2016).

On top of these issues, Venice is also facing the negative impacts of the tourism industry. Among these are: Vandalism and crime; parking problems; traffic; pollution; destruction of historical sites etc, (Van der (Van der Borg et al., 1996; Yazdi & Khanalizadeh, 2017). As a consequence, Venice is a prime example with the local population declining by two thirds in the last 50 years, with the residents moving out whilst tourist numbers have swelled' (Richardson, 2017, p.47). The UNWTO Secretary General declared the rise in anti-tourist sentiments as a very serious situation that needs to be addressed in a serious way (Tapper, 2017). There is therefore a need for alternative and more environment friendly practices in development, planning and stronger governmental and intergovernmental policies and regulations (Saarinen, 2006; S raphin, 2018 Seraphin, 2018)).

## 3 Issues, challenges and remedies for over-tourism in Venice and other destinations

Venice is one of the most active cruise ports in Southern Europe accommodating nearly several hundred ship departures and carrying one million passengers per annum. The approach for cruise shipping is particularly notable in terms of management of the flows and exit of traffic into Venice. It is still the case that cruise shipping moors along the quays close to the San Marco area. This is the source of tension between the Port and City authorities. The port authority would like to redirect the passenger traffic, but the business community in the City of Venice is keen to ensure the direct flow of tourists to the centre is not disrupted by regulation. The intention is to replace the old Vaporetto with new waterbuses (project LIUTO: Low Impact Urban Transport Omnibus) to reduce the everyday damage resulting from the wave wash that erodes the banks and increases the risks of flooding. This is a clear example of ambidextrous management strategy (tradition and modernity pulling together).

Tsai (2015), explained that ambidextrous innovation leads to a holistic innovation process, incorporating the exploitative and the exploratory. As for Brooker and Joppe (2014), they categorise innovation, first as *incremental*. It is an accepted manuscript of an article published by Elsevier in Journal of Destination Marketing and Management, available online at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2018.01.011>. It is not the copy of record. Copyright   2018, Elsevier.

is most of the time in reaction to a situation and is implemented with a short-term vision, and managers need to be customer centred. Second, *radical* innovation is proactive and subsequently disrupts current conventions. The LIUTO project is an example of radical innovation. Krizaj, Brodnik, and Bukovec (2014), claimed that the tourism industry has often lacked an innovative, radical approach, and instead has tended to rely upon incremental innovation. That said, all the strategies (taxation, advance booking systems, creation of alternative routes, virtual access, limited number of hotel beds, restricted access to piazza, etc.) put in place by the local authorities to mitigate the negative impacts of tourism in Venice has proven ineffective (Russo, 2000; Van der Borg et al., 1996). Table 1 provides examples of very recent solutions suggested by other destinations in Europe to overcome their over-tourism issue.

**Table 1** Sample of recommendations to overcome overtourism in Europe.

alt-text: Table 1

Author	Date	Title article	Source	Recommendations	Public sector (DMOs) / Private sector (DMCs)
Sicsic, J	25.08.17	Tourismophobie: Comment lutter contre l'irresponsabilité du touriste et ses excès	Tourmag.com	Repression + education of tourists)	DMO
Gordon, Y	31.08.17	Lisbon's 'we hate tourism' tours teach visitors how to travel responsibly	Independent.co.uk	-Teaching visitors how to appreciate Lisbon: -Provide tourist an authentic experience (eat and drink with locals)	DMC
Petkar, S	11.08.17	'Spain is quite full' tourists urge to travel elsewhere as protests grip holiday hotspots	Express.co.uk	-TUI Group urged clients to choose other destinations than Spain	DMC
Bressanello, A	07.08.17	Some European cities may begin limiting tourism after angry backlash	Huffingtonpost.com	Increase taxes	DMO
Buckley, J	08.10.17	Florence launches campaign telling tourists how to behave	Cntraveler.com	Respect campaign	DMO

As 'long term success will require a more holistic approach' (Richardson, 2017, p.46), we are suggesting an ambidextrous approach where public and private sectors work together (Private and Public Partnership) toward a common goal in order to trigger and maintain a long-term profitable tourism industry. Indeed, aligning multiple partners to a common purpose contribute to maximising the benefits of strategic planning (Guiver & Stanford, 2014). Whilst current and recent issues of over-tourism in Europe are mainly due to a *laissez faire* approach adopted by policymakers and entrepreneurs (Van der Borg et al., 1996), the rapid growth of tourism is expanding exponentially by a plethora of digital bookings, which promote and offer ceaseless experiences over sustainable travel. Venice particularly requires multiple strategies to ensure the nexus of interests preserving and 'selling' the city promote genuine longevity over the desire for ephemeral and illusionary portraits of a historic space captured in the hunger of the 'selfie' gaze. The placing of Venice on the endangered list might galvanise both sectors and locals to work together. The later also play a major role in the sustainability of the tourism industry of a destination (Michel, 2000). Subsequently, locals should not be considered as the 'undeserving' of the tourism industry.

Ambidextrous management should in the future underpin tourism development (Seraphin, Séraphin, 2018-2018-). Implementable practical suggestions for Venice could be geared by two constructs. First, a construct that would consist in using existing strategies to mitigate the negative impacts of tourism (exploitation) to develop a new one tailored to meet the need of the destination (exploration). Second, the construct that strategies need to be put in place to reconsider the role of Venice in Italy's Destination Management Plan. Hence the reason we are suggesting that Venice should be dropped from all promotional materials, the same way the Taj Mahal was dropped from some tourism booklets in an attempt to preserve its cultural dimension (Khalid, 2017).

## Uncited references

(Annual Tourism Survey, 2014); Bressanello, 2017); Deheyne and Shaffer, 2007; Observatoire de l'Eau Martinique, 2010; Prasad et al., 2009; Séraphin, 2014; Sissic, 2017a; Sissic, 2017b).

## References

Amey, K. (2015). 10 places you can forget about visiting. Retrieved 04.07.2015. from: ([http://www.dailymail.co.uk/travel/travel\\_news/article-3147092/A-royal-relieve-London-Italy-s-secret-religious-archae-island-inhabited-tribe-kill-sight-10-places-forget-visiting.html](http://www.dailymail.co.uk/travel/travel_news/article-3147092/A-royal-relieve-London-Italy-s-secret-religious-archae-island-inhabited-tribe-kill-sight-10-places-forget-visiting.html)).

~~Annual Tourism Survey (2014). The annual tourism survey presented yesterday in Venice. Figures help the city decide how to manage flows efficiently~~~~The annual tourism survey presented yesterday in Venice. Figures~~

help the city decide how to manage flows efficiently, *Citta di Venezia*. Amey, 2015. Amey, K. (2015). 10 places you can forget about visiting. Retrieved 04.07.15. from: [http://www.dailymail.co.uk/travel/travel\\_news/article-3147092/A-royal-reprieve-London-Italy-s-secret-religious-archive-island-inhabited-tribe-kill-sight-10-places-forget-visiting.html](http://www.dailymail.co.uk/travel/travel_news/article-3147092/A-royal-reprieve-London-Italy-s-secret-religious-archive-island-inhabited-tribe-kill-sight-10-places-forget-visiting.html)

Borg J.V.D., Costa P. and Gotti G., Tourism in European heritage cities, *Annals of Tourism Research* **23** (2), 1996, 306-321.

Bressanello, A. (2017). Some European cities may begin limiting tourism after angry backlash. Retrieved 07.08.17. 07.08.2017. from: [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/europe-tourism-backlash-us\\_59885258e4b041356ec0e5ad?ncid=engmodushpimg00000003](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/europe-tourism-backlash-us_59885258e4b041356ec0e5ad?ncid=engmodushpimg00000003); [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/europe-tourism-backlash-us\\_59885258e4b041356ec0e5ad?Ncid=engmodushpimg00000003](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/europe-tourism-backlash-us_59885258e4b041356ec0e5ad?Ncid=engmodushpimg00000003);

Brooker E. and Joppe M., *Developping Developing* a tourism innovation typology: Leveraging luminal insights, *Journal of Travel Research* **53** (4), 2014, 500-508.

Buckley, J. (2017). Florence launches campaign telling tourists how to behave. Retrieved 10.08.17. 10.08.2017. from: <http://www.cntraveler.com/story/florence-launches-campagin-telling-tourists-how-to-behave>). Colomb and Novy, 2016. Colomb J. Novy. *Protest and resistance in the tourist city* 2016. Routledge. New York

Coldwell, W. (2017). First Venice and Barcelona: Now anti-tourism marches spread across Europe. Retrieved 10.08.17. 10.08.2017. from: <http://www.theguardian.com>).

Colomb C. and Novy J. *Protest and resistance in the tourist city*, 2016, Routledge, New York.

Croes, R., Rivera, M.A.M. A., Semrad, K., & Khalizadeh, J. (2017). Happiness and tourism: Evidence from Aruba, Institute for Tourism Studies. Retrieved 18.01.18. from <http://stars.library.ucf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1040&context=dickpope-pubs>; <http://stars.library.ucf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?Article=1040&context=dickpope-pubs>).

Deheyna D. and Shaffer L.R., *Saving Venice: Engineering and ecology in the Venice lagoon*, *Technology in Society* **29**, 2007, 205-213.

Ganzaroli A., De Noni I. and Baale P.V., Vicious advice: Analysing the impact of TripAdvisor on the quality of restaurant as part of the cultural heritage of Venice, *Tourism Management* **61**, 2017, 501-510.

Guiver J. and Stanford D., *Why destination* Why destination visitor travel planning falls between the cracks, *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management* **3** (3), 2014, 140-151.

Khalid, S. (2017). Taj Mahal dropped from tourism booklet of Uttar Pradesh. Retrieved 18.01.18. 18.01.2018. from: <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2017/10/taj-mahal-dropped-tourism-booklet-uttar-pradesh-171008161648332.html>).

Krizaj D., Brodnik A. and Bukovec B., A tool measurement of innovation newness and adoption in tourism firms, *International Journal of Tourism Research* **16** (2), 2014, 113-125.

Leadbeater, C. (2017). Anti-tourism protesters in Barcelona slash tyres on sightseeing buses and rental bikes. Retrieved 02.08.17. 02.08.2017. from: <http://www.telegraph.co.uk>).

Louis-Joseph, O. (2016). Labadee reprend pour la plus belle. Retrieved 13.06.17. from: <http://lenouvelliste.com/lenouvelliste/article/155083/Labadee-reprend-pour-la-plus-belle>).

Michel F., Des hôtes et des autres. Tourisme et altérité, *Revue Espaces* **171**, 2000, 4-21.

Mihalache M. and Mihalache O.R., Organisational ambidexterity and sustained performance in the tourism industry, *Annals of Tourism Research* **56**, 2016, 128-163.

Milano, C. (2017). Overtourism y turismofobia. Tendencias globales y contextos locales. Retrieved 18.01.18. 18.01.2018. from: [http://www.aept.org/archivos/files/ostelea\\_informe\\_overtourism\\_y\\_turismofobia.pdf](http://www.aept.org/archivos/files/ostelea_informe_overtourism_y_turismofobia.pdf)).

Modak, S. (2017). Venice looks to limit tourists numbers with new measures. Retrieved 18.01.18. from: <https://www.cntraveler.com/story/venice-looks-to-limit-tourist-numbers-with-new-measures>).

Observatoire de l'Eau Martinique. (2010). Retrieved 15.11.17. from: 15.11.2017. from: <http://www.observatoire-eau-martinique.fr/autres-usages/peche-en-mer/peche-en-mer>;

Paris, N. (2017). Tourists have turned Oxford into 'hell' local claim. Retrieved 23.09.17. 23.09.2017. from: <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/travel/news/oxford-tourist-hell-overcrowding-residents-locals-complain/>).

Prasad N., Ranghieri F., Shah F. and Trohanis Z., *Climate resilient cities: A primer on reducing vulnerabilities to disasters - Venice, Italy*, 2009, World Bank, Washington, DC.

Richardson, D. (2017). *Suffering the strain of tourism* Suffering the strain of tourism, TTG@wtm [08.11.17].  
This is an accepted manuscript of an article published by Elsevier in *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management*, available online at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2018.01.011>. It is not the copy of record. Copyright © 2018, Elsevier.

Routledge P., 'Selling the rain', resisting the sale: Resistant identities and the conflict over tourism in Goa, *Social & Cultural Geography* 2 (2), 2001, 221-240.

[Russo, A.P. \(2000\). The vicious circle: of tourism development in heritage destinations. In Proceedings of 40th congress of the European Regional Science Association, Barcelona.](#)

Ryan J. and Silvano S., The world heritage list: The making and management of a brand, *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy* 5 (4), 2009, 290-300.

[Saarinen J., Traditions of sustainability in tourism studies. Annals of Tourism Research 33 \(4\), 2006, 1121-1140.](#)

Sanchez P.M. and Adams K.M., The Janus-faced character of tourism in Cuba, *Annals of Tourism Research* 35 (1), 2008, 27-46.

[Saarinen Séraphin J.H., Traditions of sustainability in tourism studies Le tourisme: L'ouverture pour le peuple de Toussaint? Annals of Tourism Research 33 \(4\), 2006, 1121-1140.](#)

Séraphin H., Natural disaster and destination management: The case of the Caribbean and hurricane Irma, *Current Issues in Tourism* 2018, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2017.1422483>.

Séraphin H., Butcher J. and Konstanje M., Challenging the negative images of Haiti at a pre-visit stage using Visual Online Learning Materials, *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events* 9 (2), 2016, 169-181. [Séraphin, 2014H.Séraphin Le tourisme: L'ouverture pour le peuple de Toussaint? 2014 Publibook Paris.](#)

[Sissie, J. \(2017/2017a\). Faut-il s'inquiéter du développement de l'anti-tourisme? anti-tourisme? TourMag.com. Retrieved 19.10.16.19.10.2016. from: \(http://www.tourmag.com/Faut-il-s-inquieter-du-developpement-de-l-anti-tourisme\\_a83390.html\).](#)

[Sissie, J. \(2017/2017b\). Tourismophobie: comment lutter contre l'irresponsabilité du touriste et de ses excès? TourMag.com. Retrieved 25.08.17.25.08.2017. From: \(http://www.tourmag.com/Tourismophobie-comment-lutter-contre-l-irresponsabilite-du-touriste-et-de-ses-exces\\_a88607.html\).](#)

Smith S., Organisational ambidexterity: Welcome to paradox city, *Human Resources Management International Digest* 25 (1), 2017, 1-3.

Stokes P., Moore N., Smith S.M., Larson M.J. and Brindley C., Organisational ambidexterity and the emerging to advanced economy nexus: Cases from private higher education operators in the United Kingdom, *Thunderbird International Business Review* 59 (3), 2016, 333-348.

Tapper, J. (2017). As touting for punt trips becomes a crime, is tourism overwhelming Britain's cities. Retrieved 30.07.17.30.07.2017. from: (<http://www.theguardian.com>).

Tsai S., Driving holistic innovation to heighten hotel customer loyalty, *Current Issues in Tourism* 20 (15), 2015, 1604-1619.

Weeden C., Legitimization through corporate philanthropy: A cruise case study, *Tourism in Marine Environments* 10 (3-4), 2015, 201-210.

World Commission on Environment and Development, Our common future, 1987, Oxford University Press; Oxford.

Yazdi S.K. and Khanalizadeh B., Tourism demand: A panel data approach, *Current Issues in Tourism* 20 (8), 2017, 787-800.

[Dr Hugues SERAPHIN](#) is a Senior Lecturer in Tourism and Event Management at the University of Winchester (England). His research focus on tourism development in post-colonial, post-conflict and post disaster destinations. Dr Hugues Seraphin has a strong interest for issues related to tourism in Europe like overtourism. [Hugues.seraphin@winchester.ac.uk](mailto:Hugues.seraphin@winchester.ac.uk)

[Dr Paul Sheeran](#) is Senior Lecturer in International Business and Economics. He teaches Macro Economics, International Relations, Corporate Global Governance, Corporate Diplomacy, and Global Political Economy. [Paul.sheeran@winchester.ac.uk](mailto:Paul.sheeran@winchester.ac.uk)

[Dr Manuela Pilato](#) joined the University of Winchester (Faculty of Business, Law and Sport) in 2014 where she lectures Responsible Management. Dr Manuela Pilato also lectures Politics (Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences). [Manuela.pilato@winchester.ac.uk](mailto:Manuela.pilato@winchester.ac.uk)

---

## Highlights

- Anti-tourism protesters are [virulent](#).
- Sustainability in tourism is still not [achieved](#).

This is an accepted manuscript of an article published by Elsevier in Journal of Destination Marketing and Management, available online at <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2018.01.011>. It is not the copy of record. Copyright © 2018, Elsevier.

- Janus-faced character of the tourism industry and ambidextrous ~~management~~management.
  - *Trexit* (term that we have created and which is a short for tourism exit).
  - ~~over-tourism~~Over-tourism is likely to be a permanent ~~phenomenon~~phenomenon.
- 

## Queries and Answers

### Query:

Please confirm that given names and surnames have been identified correctly and are presented in the desired order, and please carefully verify the spelling of all authors.

**Answer:** correct

### Query:

Your article is registered as a regular item and is being processed for inclusion in a regular issue of the journal. If this is NOT correct and your article belongs to a Special Issue/Collection please contact a.begum@elsevier.com immediately prior to returning your corrections.

**Answer:** Regular item

### Query:

The reference given here is cited in the text but is missing from the reference list - please make the list complete or remove the reference from the text: The World Bank, IBRD-IDA, 2016.

**Answer:** Unless I am wrong this reference (World Bank, IBRD-IDA, 2016) does not appear in the text. I personally can't see it anywhere

### Query:

References given here "Annual Tourism Survey, 2014; Bressanello, 2017; Deheyne and Shaffer, 2007; Observatoire de l'Eau Martinique, 2010; Prasad et al., 2009; Séraphin, 2014; Sissic, 2017a; Sissic, 2017b" were noted in the reference list but are missing from the text - please position each reference in the text or delete it from the list.

**Answer:** all deleted from the list